



## Notice of a public meeting of

### Corporate and Scrutiny Management Committee

**To:** Councillors Galvin (Chair), Fraser, Horton, Jeffries, King, McIlveen, Potter, Runciman (Vice-Chair) and Steward

**Date:** Monday, 12 May 2014

**Time:** **6.00 pm or following the CSMC (Calling In) meeting, whichever is the earlier**

**Venue:** The Thornton Room - Ground Floor, West Offices (G039)

### AGENDA

#### 1. **Declarations of Interest**

At this point, Members are asked to declare:

- any personal interests not included on the Register of Interests
- any prejudicial interests or
- any disclosable pecuniary interests

which they may have in respect of business on this agenda.

#### 2. **Minutes** (Pages 1 - 12)

To approve and sign the Minutes of meetings of the Committee held on 7 and 17 April 2014.

#### 3. **Public Participation**

At this point in the meeting members of the public who have registered to speak can do so. The deadline for registering is **5.00pm on Friday 9 May 2014**. Members of the public can speak on agenda items or matters within the remit of the committee.

To register to speak please contact the Democracy Officer for the meeting, on the details at the foot of the agenda.

### ***Filming, Recording or Webcasting Meetings***

*Please note this meeting may be filmed and webcast or audio recorded and that includes any registered public speakers, who have given their permission. The broadcast can be viewed at <http://www.york.gov.uk/webcasts> or, if sound recorded, this will be uploaded onto the Council's website following the meeting.*

*Residents are welcome to photograph, film or record Councillors and Officers at all meetings open to the press and public. This includes the use of social media reporting, i.e. tweeting. Anyone wishing to film, record or take photos at any public meeting should contact the Democracy Officer (whose contact details are at the foot of this agenda) in advance of the meeting.*

*The Council's protocol on Webcasting, Filming & Recording of Meetings ensures that these practices are carried out in a manner both respectful to the conduct of the meeting and all those present. It can be viewed at [http://www.york.gov.uk/downloads/download/3130/protocol\\_for\\_webcasting\\_filming\\_and\\_recording\\_of\\_council\\_meetings](http://www.york.gov.uk/downloads/download/3130/protocol_for_webcasting_filming_and_recording_of_council_meetings)*

#### **4. Update on Implementation of Recommendations from Previously Completed Scrutiny Reviews (Pages 13 - 28)**

This report provides Members with a further update on the implementation of recommendations arising from the following previously completed scrutiny reviews which fall within the remit of this overview & scrutiny committee:

- Managing Staff Sickness Absence Review and
- Community Engagement Review

The Assistant Director of Customer & Business Support Services and the Head of Communities and Equalities will be in attendance at the meeting to answer any questions arising.

#### **5. Draft Annual Scrutiny Report 2013-14 (Pages 29 - 40)**

This annual scrutiny report summarises the work of the five Overview & Scrutiny Committees for the municipal year May 2013 – May 2014, and asks Members to agree the report prior to presentation to Cabinet in July 2014.

**6. Procurement and Commissioning Scrutiny** (Pages 41 - 46)

This report provides an update on the work being undertaken to engage local businesses in procurement activity for the Council. Members are asked to consider the report and identify any potential improvements to the approach taken to supporting the local economy through procurement activity.

**7. Workplan 2013/14** (Pages 47 - 48)

To consider the Committee's work plan for 2013/14 and to receive a verbal update on the ongoing Equalities Scrutiny Review.

**8. Any Other Business**

Any other business which the Chair decides is urgent.

Democracy Officer:

Name: Jill Pickering

Contact details:

- Telephone – (01904) 552061
- E-mail – [jill.pickering@york.gov.uk](mailto:jill.pickering@york.gov.uk)

For more information about any of the following please contact the Democratic Services Officer responsible for servicing this meeting:

- Registering to speak
- Business of the meeting
- Any special arrangements
- Copies of reports and
- For receiving reports in other formats

Contact details are set out above.

**This information can be provided in your own language.**

**我們也用您們的語言提供這個信息 (Cantonese)**

**এই তথ্য আপনার নিজের ভাষায় দেয়া যেতে পারে। (Bengali)**

**Ta informacja może być dostarczona w twoim (Polish)  
własnym języku.**

**Bu bilgiyi kendi dilinizde almanız mümkündür. (Turkish)**

**یہ معلومات آپ کی اپنی زبان (بولی) میں بھی مہیا کی جاسکتی ہیں۔ (Urdu)**

** (01904) 551550**

City of York Council

Committee Minutes

---

Meeting	Corporate and Scrutiny Management Committee
Date	7 April 2014
Present	Councillors Galvin (Chair), Fraser, Horton, Jeffries, King, McIlveen, Potter, Runciman (Vice-Chair) and Steward

---

**44. Declarations of Interest**

Members were invited to declare at this point in the meeting any personal interests, not included on the Register of Interests, or any prejudicial or disclosable pecuniary interests they might have in respect of business on the agenda. No additional interests were declared.

**45. Minutes**

Resolved: That the minutes of the last meeting of the Committee held on 10 March 2014 be approved and signed by the Chair as a correct record.

**46. Public Participation**

It was reported that there had been no registrations to speak at the meeting under the Council's Public Participation Scheme.

**47. Workplace Wellbeing Survey 2013: Update and Action Plans**

Consideration was given to a report which provided a further update on progress arising from the 2013 Workplace Wellbeing Survey together with details of the Council's response to the survey results and Corporate Improvement Action Plan.

The Council's Diversity and Staff Engagement Advisor, presented a summary of the actions taken as a result of the 2013 survey to date, the areas where improvements had been made and details of the further actions planned, which included:

- A Corporate Improvement Action Plan, set up to address the issues raised in the survey and detailing the improvement actions being undertaken and related timescales, at Annex 1 of the report.
- Setting up a Joint Health and Safety Committee, to meet quarterly to monitor progress of the improvement action plans and oversee the stress risk assessment process.

Members referred to a number of points arising from the report, highlighting:

- The Health and Safety Executive Management Standards and reported scores in the Action Plan. Officers confirmed that the Health and Safety Executive database generated the scores which had been derived from 1,000 public and private sector organisations which provided the benchmark for assessment against. It was noted that only achievable targets were set.
- Reference to the outcome of an equality analysis of the results. In answer to a question, regarding bullying Officers confirmed that as the numbers were small it had been difficult to provide any further details.
- To address the concerns raised by staff as to where they fitted in the organisation, it was noted that this would in future be addressed in their Personal Development Reviews.
- Concerns at the staff morale results and survey response rate. The importance of walking the floor by management was noted.

Following further discussion it was

- Resolved:
- i) That the progress and achievements, since the update to Committee in November, in respect of the Workplace Wellbeing Survey 2013 be received and noted.
  - ii) That the associated Corporate and Directorate improvement action plans be received and noted.

Reason: To keep Members informed of how the results of the staff survey are used to drive improvement in workforce related matters.

**48. Final Report of Learning and Culture Overview and Scrutiny Committee on Night-Time Economy Scrutiny Review**

Consideration was given to the final report from the Improving Evening Culture Scrutiny Review, which presented the findings, conclusions and recommendations in support of the corporate scrutiny review into York's night time economy.

It was reported that this review had been delayed, pending the results of a funding application for the creation of a cultural tourist programme. The Learning and Culture Overview and Scrutiny Committee had undertaken a review with the aim of identifying an improved cultural offer up to 8pm in order to extend the tourist day and encourage more tourists to stay for longer or overnight, with a particular emphasis on families.

It was noted that one of the most important conclusions of this review had been that in order to achieve an improvement in the city centre early evening economy this could only be undertaken with partnership working between cultural, entertainment, retail and transport providers.

The recommendations from this review would be considered in more detail, by the Task Group set up to consider the findings and recommendations arising from all the completed reviews prior to presentation of the corporate list for consideration at the Committee's meeting on 17 April.

Members made a number of comments in relation to the report and recommendations, in particular:

- Officers acknowledged the omission of the equalities implications which would be added to the final report.
- The need for a weekly listing of events, possibly through joint working with the Universities
- Possible use of smaller venues, e.g. Jacob's Well, Trinity Lane, during any downtime
- Use of the York Pass attraction card for residents over a longer, 12 month period

Following further discussion it was

Resolved: That account be taken of the findings and recommendations from the Improving the Evening Culture Scrutiny Review as part of the ongoing work

to conclude the corporate scrutiny review on York's Night Time Economy.

Reason: To ensure compliance with scrutiny procedures and protocols, and enable the final report from the ongoing corporate scrutiny review of York's Night Time Economy to be completed, ready for presentation to Cabinet in May 2014.

#### **49. York After Five**

Members considered the York After Five report prepared by the Policy, Performance and Change Manager in conjunction with the Office of the Chief Executive, which provided additional evidence to assist with the work on the ongoing scrutiny review of York's evening economy.

The Policy and Performance Officer presented the report highlighting that consultation had shown that all cities were experiencing similar issues in relation to the early evening economy. It was suggested that Members may wish to consider setting up a Tourism Action Group similar to that in Edinburgh, which had provided a collaborative ideas guide for businesses on how to create a joined up experience for visitors to the city.

Members highlighted a number of additional issues for consideration, arising from the report, including:

- Need for consideration of health and safety issues, arising from recent fatalities in the rivers
- Reference to previous failed bid for the setting up a Business Improvement District (BID), owing to a lack of take up
- Reference to suggestion of evening/night buses and current issues with some day time services

Following further discussion it was

Resolved: That the contents of the report be noted for consideration as part of the evidence supporting the Night Time Economy corporate scrutiny review.

Reason: To provide additional evidence to inform the conclusions and recommendations of the corporate NTE scrutiny review.



**50. Attendance of Cabinet Member for Finance, Performance & Customer Services- End Of Year Update**

The Cabinet Member for Finance, Performance and Customer Services attended the meeting and provided an end of year update together with details of his priorities for the forthcoming year.

He reported the main areas of interest as:

Budget 2014/15

A balanced budget had been delivered in February for 2013/14 and a 2 year budget had been set which would deliver significant reductions. He referred to increasing future challenges and to lessons learnt which meant that a stronger watching brief would be kept on budgets to ensure that they did not go off track.

Rewiring of Public Services

It was confirmed that the Rewiring of Public Services currently being undertaken would tie in with the national programme, with the main focus being on transformation. He outlined the key areas being examined as business efficiency, community and resident engagement, placed based services, Children's and Adults Social Care and Young People's Services. As lead Cabinet Member for the programme he would be the single point of contact for each of these work streams.

Customer Service

With a number of recent changes to the benefits system having had a much greater affect than had been anticipated, he acknowledged that there had been delays in dealing with claims although these were now back on track. The priority in this area for the forthcoming year was to improve the quality of the service. Work was also ongoing to provide online residents parking forms in order to provide an improved service at a reduced cost.

Financial Inclusion

With the co-location of services in West Offices this had greatly assisted with partnership working. The York Financial Assistance Scheme had been set up to help residents in genuine financial hardship and provided up to 3 grants over a 12 month period. Further promotion of the scheme was required

and a review would be undertaken on which member's comments were welcomed.

### Customer Service

The Cabinet Member referred to the extensive work undertaken in the Customer Services department to improve customer response times. Following an inspection by the Department of Work and Pensions this work had been recognised nationally in a case study.

Members thanked the Cabinet Member for his report and went on to question a number of areas including:

- The need for cross party involvement with the transformation and change work being undertaken, particularly in relation to rural areas. The Cabinet Member acknowledged that further input would be welcomed.
- Work around early intervention would be required to ensure improvements in Adult Social Care, however much of this was not delivered in-house. The Cabinet Member again acknowledged these comments and confirmed the need to examine how this worked in other authorities. Services could involve a mix of bodies, including those in-house.
- Reference to completion of service forms and the need to ensure that this could be undertaken by all Customer Service personnel.
- Concerns at the loss of the Head of Children's Services and the need to ensure that work in this area did not lose its priority and monitoring.
- With the creation of the Yorkshire Purchasing Association as a Limited Company it was essential that the new board comprised of both Members and Officers to provide both a financial and monitoring role. The Cabinet Member confirmed the need for board members to have business and financial expertise.

Following further discussion it was

Resolved:            That the Cabinet Members report be received and noted.

Reason: To provide the Committee with an update on the implementation of his priorities for the municipal year.

**51. Draft Work Plan for 2014/15**

Consideration was given to the Committee's draft work plan for the forthcoming municipal year the main content at present being overview items.

Officers reported the need to slip the End of Year Update which was to have been provided by the Deputy Leader at the May meeting to the June meeting.

As Chair of the ongoing Equalities Review Task Group, Cllr Potter, highlighted the need for the Group to undertake additional work to ensure a thorough review was undertaken however that meant that the review would not be completed by the end of the current municipal year.

The Chair referred to the need to set a date for the annual Scrutiny Work Planning meeting. This had been suggested as Monday 12 May 2014 at 6pm, following the scheduled Corporate and Scrutiny Management Committee meeting. Member would be contacted by Officers to make further arrangements.

Resolved: That the Committee's draft work plan for the 2014/15 municipal year be received and noted subject to the following amendment:

23 June 2014

Attendance of Deputy Leader – End of Year Update  
(Slip from 19 May 2014 meeting)

Reason: To update Members and provide an overview of the Committee's work for the 2014/15 municipal year.

**52. Work Plan 2013/14**

Consideration was given to the Committee's work plan for the 2013/14 municipal year.

Officers referred to the moving of the Deputy Leaders End of Year Update from the May to the June meeting of the Committee.

Resolved: That the Committee's 2013/14 work plan be received and noted.

Reason: To update Members on work carried out during the current municipal year.

Councillor J Galvin, Chair

[The meeting started at 5.00 pm and finished at 6.25 pm].

---

Meeting	Corporate and Scrutiny Management Committee
Date	17 April 2014
Present	Councillors Galvin (Chair), Fraser, Horton, Jeffries, King, Potter, Runciman (Vice-Chair) and Steward
In attendance	Councillor D'Agorne
Apologies	Councillor McIlveen

---

### **53. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

Members were invited to declare at this point in the meeting any personal interests, not included on the Register of Interests, or any prejudicial or disclosable pecuniary interests they might have in respect of business on the agenda. No additional interests were declared.

### **54. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION**

It was reported that there had been no registrations to speak at the meeting under the Council's Public Participation Scheme.

### **55. NIGHT-TIME ECONOMY SCRUTINY REVIEW - DRAFT FINAL REPORT**

Members considered a report which presented the findings from the corporate scrutiny review of York's Night Time Economy which incorporated the findings from the individual scrutiny reviews carried out by the four standing overview and scrutiny committees. Account had also been taken of the findings from a 'Yorkafter5' survey, proposals for NewCo a new marketing organisation, the work of AVANTE and evidence provided by the Council's Policy and Performance team.

Consideration was also given to the following additional information provided at the meeting;

- Update on the Financial implications information at paragraph 32 of the draft final report in relation to the

cost of extending the opening hours for Park and Ride sites (copies circulated and updated online)

- Draft Preface prepared by Cllr Galvin as Chair of the Corporate and Scrutiny Management Committee and its Task Group set up to consolidate the recommendations.

The Scrutiny Officer presented the report and recommendations prepared by a Task Group consisting of Cllrs Galvin, Horton and Runciman set up to consider all the evidence and look at how best to package the recommendations.

The Chair drew Members attention to the suggested recommendations, set out at paragraphs 29 and 30, of the report, pointing out that whilst the individual Task Groups had each produced a number of recommendations the Group had acknowledged that four key recommendations were more likely to be achievable, receive Cabinet support and be easier to implement, in the first instance.

Members confirmed their support for the four key recommendations and, in particular the introduction of a pilot scheme for extending the opening hours in the Coppergate Shopping Centre on Friday evenings. It was pointed out that, if successful, the Coppergate area could act as a hub for further expansion/future roll out.

Members went on to question a number of points including the reasons for extending free car parking for residents only from 5pm rather than 6pm and highlighting the need for inclusion of positive equalities implications in the report. Officers confirmed that although they had no financial information in relation other options regarding free parking, if Members were in agreement, two options could be put forward for consideration, with implications information to follow.

Following further discussion it was

- Resolved:
- i) That the report and documentation provided in support of the review be received and noted.
  - ii) That the Committee agree the recommendations arising from the final report of the Night Time Economy Corporate Scrutiny Review, incorporating the findings from the

individual scrutiny reviews, for presentation to Cabinet on 6 May 2014, subject to inclusion of the following additional information:

- The positive equalities implications which would arise from the recommendations
- The following two options in respect of city centre parking:
  - The Council's city centre car parks to be free to residents with Minster badges from 5pm (instead of 6pm at present) on Fridays during the pilot period
  - The Council's city centre car parks in the vicinity of the Coppergate Centre to be free to all from 5pm on Fridays during the pilot period.

Reason: To conclude the work on the Corporate Scrutiny Review in line with CYC scrutiny procedures and protocols.

Councillor J Galvin, Chair

[The meeting started at 5.00 pm and finished at 5.20 pm].

This page is intentionally left blank





---

**Corporate & Scrutiny Management Committee**  
Report of the Assistant Director, Governance & ICT

**12 May 2014**

**Update on Implementation of Recommendations from Previously Completed Scrutiny Reviews**

**Summary**

1. This report provides Members with a further update on the implementation of the recommendations arising from the previously completed scrutiny reviews which fall within the remit of this overview & scrutiny committee.

**Background**

2. Staff Sickness Absence Management Scrutiny Review  
At a Scrutiny Event for Members in July 2011, the Committee agreed to carry out a scrutiny review on staff sickness, specifically to identify ways of reducing sickness absence levels across the organisation. The Committee agreed to set up a Task Group to gather information on the potential areas of focus for the review for the full committee's consideration.
3. In January 2012, this Committee received a scoping report for the review detailing the Task Group's initial findings and as a result, agreed the following objectives for the review:

Objectives:

- i. To revise the Council's Absence Management Policy & procedures to ensure they take account of iTrent, are in line with best practice, and written in a more formal assertive language;
- ii. To identify improvements in:
  - a. the provision of Management training
  - b. the induction programme for all new staff

- iii. To explore ways of introducing a change in culture within the workforce moving away from a policy of 'managing absence', towards one of 'encouraging attendance'.
4. Work on the review concluded in March 2013 and the final report was presented to Cabinet in May 2013.
5. In November 2013, this Committee received its first update on the progress made with implementing the approved recommendations, and as a result Recommendations (i) – (vii) were signed off as fully implemented. The Committee requested a further update on the remaining recommendations for this meeting- see Annex A.
6. Customer Engagement Scrutiny Review  
In September 2012, having considered a scrutiny topic submitted by Cllr Barnes on 'Engaging the Disaffected', the Committee agreed to undertake a scrutiny review to look at the issues affecting levels of community engagement across the city, in the following three areas:
  - i. Community Engagement
  - ii. CYC Customer Services
  - iii. Financial Inclusion
7. A Task Group was set up to scope and carry out the work on the review on behalf of the full committee, and following some initial investigation, the following review remit was agreed:

To identify ways of empowering people and improving community engagement

Objectives:

  - a. To improve communications between CYC and Parish Councils
  - b. To improve communications in non-Parish Council areas.
8. The final report and the review recommendations were presented to Cabinet in June 2013, and the first update on the implementation of those recommendations was presented to this Committee in November 2013. Having noted the information provided, the Committee chose not to sign off any of the recommendations. Instead a further update was requested for this meeting - see Annex B.

## **Consultation**

9. The Assistant Director of Customer & Business Support Services has provided the update information contained within Annex A, and the Head of Communities and Equalities has provided the update information contained within Annex B. Both will be in attendance at this meeting to answer any questions arising.

## **Options**

10. Members may decide to sign off any individual recommendations where implementation has been completed, and can:
  - a. request further updates and the attendance of the relevant officers at a future meeting to clarify any outstanding recommendations relating to the above reviews or;
  - b. agree to receive no further updates on those reviews

## **Council Plan 2011-15**

11. In regard to the Staff Sickness Absence Management Review, the Council Plan recognises that staff are the most important resource of the Council and without whom it could not deliver its services and priorities. Ensuring staff receive the proper levels of support in times of illness etc is one way in which staff can be made to feel valued and engaged.
12. The Community Engagement Review supported the council's aim to build strong communities and be a city full of active and self-reliant communities, where everyone has an effective voice in local issues and where there is a strong sense of belonging.

## **Implications**

13. There are no known Financial, Human Resources, Equalities, Legal, ITT or other implications associated with the recommendation made in this report.

## **Risk Management**

14. In compliance with the Council's risk management strategy, there are no known risks associated with this report.

## **Recommendations**

15. Members are asked to note the contents of this report and sign off all recommendations that have been fully implemented.

Reason: To raise awareness of those recommendations which are still to be fully implemented.

**Contact Details**

**Author:**

Melanie Carr  
Scrutiny Officer  
Scrutiny Services  
01904 552063

**Chief Officer Responsible for the report:**

Andrew Docherty  
Assistant Director, Governance & ICT  
01904 55

**Report Approved**



**Date**

1May 2014

**Wards Affected:**

**All**



**For further information please contact the author of the report**

**Background Papers:** None

**Annexes:**

**Annex A** – Update on Staff Sickness Absence Management Review

**Annex B** – Update on Community Engagement Review

### Implementation Update of Approved Recommendations from Sickness Absence Management Scrutiny Review

Recommendation	HR Response in May 2013	Implementation Status as of November 2013	Implementation Status as of May 2014
viii) Managers should report quarterly to DMT on absence figures.	iTrent sickness absence reports are currently under development; however the reports are dependant upon development work around management structures and sickness absence reasons. Sickness absence reports will be gradually rolled out across directorates in line with People Manager implementation, Midland HR is required to support this work. It is anticipated that no MI reports will go out to directorates until the structure work is completed, which is not likely to be until the end of June 2013.	The structure work on iTrent has been delayed due to a re-phasing of People Manager rollout work - all structure work will now be completed by 31 <sup>st</sup> October 2013 to provide accurate management information reporting, taking into account recent Directorate restructures. The introduction of iTrent People Manager will enable managers to input sickness absence directly on to the iTrent system. This should ensure that all sickness is input in a timelier manner so will further improve the accuracy of iTrent sickness absence reports.	The structure work on iTrent is due to be completed by 30 <sup>th</sup> June 2014. Management Information reports - two MI Officers have recently been appointed and a Quarter 4 Digest report will be produced by 31 <sup>st</sup> May 2014. The introduction of iTrent People Manager will enable managers to input sickness absence directly on to the iTrent system, however further work on the system needs to be completed by MidlandHR before this can commence; it is anticipated that this work will be completed in June and a pilot group will be set up to test sickness absence.
ix) HR should look at positive ways of promoting good	Promotion of good attendance is most successful at a local manager level. Guidance will be included for managers to		Roll out of manager training via the Workforce Development Unit on managing sickness absence

<p>attendance, e.g. recognition for those employees who have no or low rates of absence e.g. letter from Chief Executive, Xtra Factor Award.</p>	<p>recognise good attendance in PDR's and 1:1 meetings, to make recognition more personal.</p> <p>A council wide recognition scheme would incur administration costs. Such schemes can also have equalities implications &amp; negative effects on employees where absences are unavoidable e.g. to attend an operations or linked to a disability.</p> <p>The staff survey will ask a number of questions to highlight trends and reasons why staff may have poor attendance or are not engaged e.g. pressure of work, stress, bullying. Addressing these issues in subsequent action plans will assist in improving attendance.</p> <p>The following question will also be included in the next survey to help further inform the work to promote good attendance - <i>'I feel good attendance should be recognised'</i></p> <p>In addition HR will continue to a promote ways to maximise</p>		<p>on an ongoing programme. HR has also worked with the Health and Safety Team to promote a calendar of health and wellbeing, with a theme being promoted each month to help staff look after themselves</p>
--	--	--	--

	attendance e.g. flexible working opportunities.		
x) Two HR officers should be designated as 'GO TO' officers (see 4 <sup>th</sup> bullet point in paragraph 49 of final report).	The First Contact Network is a staff volunteer group available to offer support to employees who are being bullying or harassed at the work. Within HR the Employee Relations (ER) team is the key contact for employees who have queries in relation to the Attendance Management Procedure or who need general guidance on other policy related issues. However, there is currently no provision in place for staff to access completely impartial advice as per the recommendation. This will be reviewed following the completion of the HR restructure.		Plans are in place to train the staff volunteers in the First Contact Network in basic training in how to support other staff who are misusing alcohol. This is part of our new HR policy on Substance Misuse and supporting staff at risk of developing substance dependencies.
xi) CYC's Counselling Services should be re-publicised.	The counselling services will be re-published during the launch of the policy, during Attendance management training and on colin, buzz etc. There have been some recent changes to the counselling	The demand for the counselling service continues to increase and has been promoted through events like the health and wellbeing week recently held in West Offices. The triage service put in place by the OH	The council has just adopted an Employee Assistance Provider, which will provide more flexible counselling services and advice on relationship, debt, housing, and other personal issues.

	<p>services available for staff. Due to a significant increase in demand for counselling services year on year and the fixed price nature of the previous NHS contract, when the negotiations to extend the NHS contract took place the current level of service across the OH contract could not be maintained for the previous price. Employees will continue to self refer for counselling services; OH will then triage the referral. Where counselling is not the best source of assistance the employee will be signposted to either a specialist charity organisations or mainstream NHS services.</p>	<p>provider to ensure that counselling is the best route of support continues. However as we are moving to a new OH contract, the specification requires a more flexible approach to counselling with requirement for the providers to offer a variety of delivery methods i.e. telephone; and web based counselling as well as the more traditional face to face service</p>	
<p>xii) CSMC should re-visit the question of how best to create a change in culture once the revised policy and change to working practices had been embedded</p>			<p>A draft Organisational Development Strategy and Action Plan is due to go to CMT in June, and will include interventions designed to help change the culture in CYC to support the Transformation programme.</p>



throughout the organisation.			
At a meeting of Corporate & Scrutiny Management Committee on 11 November 2013, Recommendations (i) – (vii) were signed off as fully completed, with the request that a further update be provided in six months time (May 2014)			

This page is intentionally left blank

**Update on Implementation of Approved Recommendations  
Arising From Engaging Communities Scrutiny Review**

Approved Scrutiny Recommendation	Update on Implementation in November 2013	Update as of May 2014
i. Resident Association meeting dates to be included in the Council's Corporate Calendar, in the same way that Parish Council meeting dates are.	The dates for the Resident Forum meetings are currently uploaded via ModernGov. We are working with Resident Association to encourage them to contact the Council direct to update Agenda and Minutes of meetings.	Dates for Resident Association meeting are uploaded onto Mod Gov. Agendas and minutes are available through the designated council pages. <a href="http://www.york.gov.uk/info/200535/residents_associations/362/residents_associations">http://www.york.gov.uk/info/200535/residents_associations/362/residents_associations</a>
ii. Corporate Calendar to include both formal and informal Resident Forum meeting dates	Community and Equalities team uploaded as meetings are confirmed.	
iii. Introduce Resident Association and Parish Council Forum pages on the CYC website, for the Council to use to disseminate information quickly and regularly e.g. to highlight consultations etc	There is a Residents Association page on the CYC with links to each of the 19 Residents Associations. <a href="http://www.york.gov.uk/info/200535/residents_associations/362/residents_associations">http://www.york.gov.uk/info/200535/residents_associations/362/residents_associations</a> There is also a page for Parish Councils, again providing information about each Parish Council and a link to their website. <a href="http://democracy.york.gov.uk/mgListCommittees.aspx?PC=1&amp;bcr=1">http://democracy.york.gov.uk/mgListCommittees.aspx?PC=1&amp;bcr=1</a>	

<p>iv. Adjoining Parish Councils to be informed of significant planning applications which are likely to affect their parish</p>	<p>Planning Team to provide update</p>	
<p>v. Training on the importance of the relationship with Parish Councils and Residents Associations should be included in the induction programme for new Councillors.</p>	<p>We have approached the Federation to ask if they would work with us to help develop a training workshop that can be added to the annual training programme and induction programme. We will be taking the same approach with the Parish Council Liaison Group to co produce a training workshop. We have also produced a number of fact sheets as a resource for councillors including one on parish councils and one on residents associations and York Residents Federation and have run a drop in session with members to introduce and promote these.</p>	
<p>vi. Ward Councillors to receive the minutes from Parish Council and Resident Association meetings, and it should be considered good practice to attend PC &amp; RA meetings</p>	<p>An article was placed in the Members newsletter, informing councillors of the links to the pages on the council website, so that they can access the meeting minutes of both the Parish Councils and Resident Associations. A high percentage of councillors attend their relevant Parish Council and Residents Association meetings.</p>	

<p>vii. In regard to council consultation, more time should be given to enable Parish Councils and Residents Associations to participate, as consultation needs to go to a meeting for discussion, not just to individuals.</p>	<p>A working group has looked specifically at this topic and developed new resources to support staff through the consultation and engagement process. A training workshop was delivered to staff on the 27<sup>th</sup> September – the first of a programme of workshops, to promote good practice, promoted through corporate training offer. The resources will be launched as part of the upgraded to the council’s intranet system.</p> <p>The Federation recently met with Kersten and offered to play a role in future council consultation – how this will operate will be worked up with the Federation.</p>	<p>We are working to make resources available to staff via the current intranet system due to technical difficulties with the proposed new site.</p>
<p>viii. The council to ensure that feedback is given to PCs and RAs on their consultation responses</p>	<p>This is improving following the work of the working group and further improvements should be seen through the resources available via the new intranet. Further workshops and training will be developed with the Federation and Parish Councils.</p>	<p>See above</p>
<p>ix. Council to notify PCs &amp; RAs of significant changes to services e.g. Christmas recycling arrangements, green bin charges etc</p>	<p>Waste services inform RAs and PCs directly of any planned changes to services, usually by e-mail. Using a list of established contacts, all contacts are sent information directly informing them of the changes and providing any necessary</p>	

	literature that their organisation can display. This method is also used by Waste Services to deal with 'one off' issues that arise, resulting in potential service disruption, such as severe weather or floods.	
x. All Council service providers to use Parish Council/ Resident Association notice boards and newsletters more to communicate council information relevant to the area	The Communities & Equalities Team provides information about available notice boards and a list of contact key holders.	
xi. Council documents should be checked for jargon i.e. continued use of Plain English	From a Democratic Services perspective, wherever possible reports are checked for plain English and the use of abbreviations prior to publication. Logistically on occasion this is not possible when reports are received late by Democratic Services and the statutory deadline for publication has to be met. The Council's communications team issue guidance to all staff on the use of Plain English and the standards that should be observed on social media. Further advice will be issued to all staff.	
xii. Report authors to include appendix of abbreviations in reports where appropriate - to aid ease of reading. The list can be	Current practice is to state in full the name of an organisation/initiative etc for its reference in a report, with the abbreviation in brackets alongside. Throughout the	

<p>tailored to each committee and duplicated for all reports relevant to that committee, with revisions/additions where needed</p>	<p>report thereafter it is acceptable to use the abbreviation. Annexing a separate list of abbreviations may not be the most environmentally friendly solution. Neither would it be a user friendly solution, as the reader would have to flick back and forth to search for each abbreviation used. The appropriate use of a separate annex would be where a report contains a significant number of technical abbreviations. In addition, the Heads of Civic &amp; Democratic Services and Strategy, Partnerships &amp; Communication are planning to work together to deliver a revised report template, style guide and associated training to improve the way reports are presented to the public in general, which will include addressing this issue.</p>	
<p>xiii. Improve joint working at Ward Team Meetings by the adoption of the Statement of Intent shown at para 41 of the final report.</p>	<p>The Communities and Equalities Team are liaising with Councillors to add to discussions at Ward Team Meetings.</p>	
<p>xiv. Communities &amp; Equalities Team to identify areas of the city where no Parish Council or Resident Association currently exists and identify a private resident association or some other type of community group to</p>	<p>Each Resident Associations page on the Council website now provides a map showing the area covered by the Association.</p> <p>Parish Council areas can be identified using the YorkMap on the council website.</p>	

disseminate council information through.	Work is continuing to identify community groups in areas not covered by either a Parish Council or Residents Association	
<u>Scrutiny Comments on Updates Received</u> Nov 2013 – No recommendations signed off – Further update required in six months (May 2014).		





---

**Corporate & Scrutiny Management Committee****12 May 2014**

Report of the Assistant Director of Governance &amp; ICT

**Draft Annual Scrutiny Report 2013-14****Summary**

1. This annual scrutiny report summarises the work of the five Overview & Scrutiny Committees for the municipal year May 2013 – May 2014, and asks Members to agree the report prior to its presentation to Cabinet in July 2014.

**Background**

2. This committee is charged with monitoring overall performance in relation to scrutiny review work and providing an annual report to Full Council. The last annual report for the period June 2012 – May 2013 was presented to this Committee in September 2013 and to Council in October 2013.

**Consultation**

3. Consultation was not required for the production of this annual report. However, consultation is an important element of Overview & Scrutiny and is regularly carried out in support of all scrutiny reviews.
4. The final reports produced for each of the reviews completed during the period June 2013 – May 2014 detail all of the work undertaken, including any consultation carried out. Those final reports and all supporting information can be viewed in full at:

<http://democracy.york.gov.uk/ecCatDisplay.aspx?sch=doc&cat=13029&path=13028>

**Options**

5. Having considered the Annual Report, Members may choose to:
  - Agree any amendments required to the report

- Approve the report for presentation to the meeting of Full Council in July 2014.

### **Scrutiny Reviews in 2013-14**

#### 6. Corporate Scrutiny Review

In June 2013, Corporate & Scrutiny Management Committee expressed an interest in carrying out a corporate scrutiny review during the 2013-14 municipal year to which each of the Overview & Scrutiny Committees could contribute.

7. The Corporate & Scrutiny Management Committee considered two topics which cut across the remits of all the scrutiny committees (Improving York's Night-Time Economy and Impacts of Mental Health) and chose to proceed with a corporate review on York's Night Time Economy (NTE) based on its connection to a number of the Council's current key priorities in the Council Plan 2011-2015.
8. Each Overview & Scrutiny Committee was tasked with identifying a suitable review remit, based on their individual terms of reference, which led to the following reviews being undertaken:
  - Economic & City Development (ECSOSC) – to encourage longer retail opening hours and enhance evening access in and out of the city centre;
  - Health – to identify the impact of the night-time economy on the Emergency Department at York Hospital at peak times;
  - Community Safety – to examine ways to improve the attractiveness and cleanliness of the city centre in the evening;
  - Learning and Culture – to identify an improved cultural offer up to 8pm in order to extend the tourist day and encourage more tourists to stay for longer or overnight, with particular emphasis on families.
9. To support the night-time economy corporate review an online survey 'Yorkafter5' was undertaken in late Autumn 2013 which included questions in support of all the reviews except the health related review for which separate surveys were agreed.
10. The ECSOSC review gathered information on cities similar to York to establish a benchmark for the night-time economy and to establish best practice elsewhere. Key partners, including representatives of York Retail Forum, the Federation of Small Businesses, City Team York, bus companies and private hire federations were also involved in the review.

11. Members of the Health OSC met with officials at York Hospital to gather information related to peaks in Emergency Department admissions, particularly late Friday night / early Saturday mornings and late Saturday night / early Sunday mornings. They also met with representatives from Yorkshire Ambulance Service; NHS Trust; the Vale of York Clinical Commissioning Group and Street Angels, and received information from the GP Out of Hours Service. Committee Members also spent two nights in the hospital Emergency Department to witness the work of the department and any difficulties staff faced.
12. The Community Safety OSC chose not to carry out a review on anti-social behaviour associated with the city centre night-time economy, having agreed any such review would duplicate work of AVANTE (Alcohol and Violence in the Night-Time Economy), a multi-agency task group of the Safer York Partnership. Instead they agreed to focus their review on city centre street cleaning and associated issues related to commercial waste presentation and miss-use of flyers, which both lead to additional work for the city centre street cleaning teams. However in light of the limited time available for a full and proper review, the Committee recommended that work to address these ongoing issues be undertaken as a matter of priority by Public Realm officers working with CYC Waste Services and Safer York Partnership.
13. At the beginning of the municipal year the Learning and Culture OSC, learnt of work already underway by the Council and its partners on a new high-level tourism strategy for the city, and of an application for funding to Visit England/Arts Council England. The Committee agreed to postpone their NTE review until the outcome of the funding application was known, recognising it would directly affect their choice of topic. In February 2014, having learnt that the application for funding had been unsuccessful, the Task Group agreed to look at how the tourist day might be extended and residents encouraged to visit the city between 5-8pm. They also met the Consortium behind the bid to investigate what elements within the application individual organisations would be taking forward.
14. The NTE final reports from Economic & City Development, Health and Community Safety Committees were presented to CSMC in March 2014 while the Learning and Culture Committee presented their report in early April 2014. CSMC set up a Task Group to collate the findings from the individual reviews and package the draft recommendations, enabling the NTE Corporate Review final report to be presented to Cabinet in early May 2014. Overall CSMC were pleased with the outcome of the corporate review recognising the work of all those involved, and agreed

to repeat the corporate approach in future years to ensure continuing corporate and city-wide engagement with scrutiny.

15. Other Committee Reviews:

The following scrutiny reviews were also carried out by the Overview & Scrutiny Committees in the last municipal year:

- Equalities Review

In November 2013 CSMC agreed to proceed with a review to raise awareness of the democratic process amongst York's Communities of Identity, and identify any required equalities training for Members. A Task Group was set up and it intends holding a consultation event at the Mansion House at the end of June 2014 to meet with representatives from York's minority communities to raise awareness of the democratic process, ways of getting involved, and to identify any barriers preventing their community engagement/involvement. Work on the review is expected to be concluded by early September 2014.

- External Funding Scrutiny Review

In January 2013 an ECDOSC Task Group commenced a review into ways of unlocking potential external funding for economic development and regeneration projects. Its key objectives were to assess Leeds City Region's investment priorities, what resources were available to City of York Council and to present a strong case to attract funding for York's top investment priorities. Over a series of meetings the Task Group gathered evidence which led to a number of strategic recommendations being agreed by ECDOSC in September 2013 and presented to Cabinet in November 2013.

- Construction Skills Scrutiny Review

In July 2013 an ECDOSC Task Group was set up to investigate a national and, particularly, northern England shortage of skilled builders and to see what the Council and its partners could do to address this skills gap and prepare for future growth. After examining the existing training provision and funding landscape the Task Group received details of the current situation in York, information on best practice in other local authorities and feedback from employers. Task Group Members also took part in meetings with the Property Forum of York's Chamber of Commerce, YorCity Construction and York College at which they spoke to current apprentices to identify possible obstacles to the recruitment process. The Task Group's final report was endorsed by ECDOSC in March 2014 and went to Cabinet on 6 May 2014.

- Online Business / E-Commerce Scrutiny Review  
An ECDOSC Task Group was formed in January 2014 to identify how CYC may better support city businesses to develop their online opportunities and improve their sales, marketing and profitability. To identify any gaps in this support an online survey was launched asking businesses for feedback and the Task Group also received information on how other towns and cities are supporting the development of online business opportunities. The Task Group expect their work to be completed in the summer of 2014.
- Domestic Waste Recycling Scrutiny Review  
In July 2012, the Community Safety OSC set up a Task Group to look at ways of increasing domestic waste recycling. The Task Group carried out an analysis of the recycling rates for the 20 top performing Local Authorities in order to identify best practice. The Task Group agreed to focus their work in support of the council's 2013-14 'Recycle More' initiative, which led to delays in the review whilst the work on that initiative was undertaken. The second phase of a major piece of work to gather evidence on the effectiveness of initiatives employed to improve kerbside recycling and reduce the amount of waste sent to landfill was scheduled between January and March 2014. Work is now underway to evaluate the impact of that work and the review final report is expected by July 2014.
- A-Boards Scrutiny Review  
In April 2013 the Community Safety OSC, having considered information on the implications associated with implementing a total ban on the use of A-boards, agreed to proceed with a scrutiny review to identify some sensible guidelines for the use of A-boards across the whole city. A public consultation event was held on 5 February 2014 and the Task Group is working with key stakeholders and businesses to draft guidance for the future use of A-Boards. The review is ongoing and completion is expected summer 2014.
- Community Mental Health Services & Care of Young People Scrutiny Review  
A Health Scrutiny Task Group was set up in November 2012 to raise awareness of emotional and mental health issues for young people, and the services and interventions available, with a view to ensuring that the wider children's workforce are well informed and equipped to identify and respond to children and young people with emotional problems and/or emerging mental health issues. The review looked at ways of improving multi-agency working, and encouraged York secondary schools to introduce a Mental Health School Charter,

setting out what strategies, resources and support systems were in place to help pupils, carers and support staff to identify and cope with emerging emotional or mental health issues. The review final report was presented to Cabinet in December 2013.

- Personalisation Security Review

In July 2012 a Health Scrutiny Task Group commenced a review around take up and administration of personal budgets so people could exercise as much choice and control over their lives as possible. In an effort to identify key priorities around personalisation and make improvements, the review brought together residents, and service and support providers, to identify the areas of strength and weakness in City of York Council's approach to personalisation. The review included two workshops facilitated by an independent consultant and CYC commissioned a POET (Personal Outcomes and Evaluation Tool) survey, carried out by In Control - a national charity which helps people to live the life they choose - to collect and compare data from personal budget holders in the area. A representative from In Control attended a February 2014 Task Group meeting to help establish priority areas and clarify any implications associated with them. The review final report was signed off by Health OSC in April 2014 and presented to Cabinet in May 2014.

- Men's Health Scrutiny Review

In July 2013 the Health OSC received a verbal report which highlighted that the bottom 20% of men in York had been "cast adrift" and had significantly different and poorer life expectancy. The Committee formed a Task Group to establish the main causes of premature male deaths and analyse ways in which the most vulnerable could be targeted. Having received detailed information from CYC's Consultant in Public Health the Task Group recommended the topic should not be progressed as the review was too wide ranging and that meaningful work on the topic could not be done over the period of a municipal year. It was therefore agreed, the topic could be re-considered at a later date.

- Careers Education Information and Guidance (CEIAG) Task Group Scrutiny Review

In early 2013 a Learning & Culture Task Group was set up to assess the standard of CEIAG for young people in York, and where appropriate identify improvements. The Task Group held a number of consultation meetings with training providers, partner agencies, business and local authority representatives, and young people as they gathered evidence in support of the review. The Task Group's

conclusions and the recommendations were endorsed by the Learning & Culture OSC in September 2013 and presented to Cabinet in November 2013.

- School Meals Scrutiny Review

In June 2013, the Learning & Culture OSC agreed a scrutiny topic on the take up of school meals, and free school meals and set up a Task Group to investigate how to improve take-up. Shortly after the review started, the Government announced its plans to provide free school meals for all infants. The Task Group recognised this would lead to a substantial increase in the numbers receiving a school meal, and requested additional information to understand the knock on effects on schools and on the council's current contract. They met with representatives from the Local Authority's school meal provider and received detailed information on the contract and the challenges the provider had faced since taking up the contract three years earlier. In September 2013, the Task Group met with representatives of the Youth Council to gather their views on school meals. They also carried out a number of school visits and gathered the views of parents. The Task Group's draft final report was signed off by Learning and Culture OSC in March 2014, and presented to Cabinet in May 2014.

### **Supporting the Council Plan 2011-15**

16. All of the reviews carried out during 2013-14 (identified above) took account of the Council's need to be inclusive and ensure equality in accessing the services being reviewed. Each review also supported a number of the council's other improvement priorities and direction statements:
17. The following reviews were directly linked to the 'Protect Vulnerable People' element of the Council Plan 2011-15:
  - Night-Time Economy Review;
  - School Meals Review;
  - Community Mental Health Services and Care of Young People Review;
  - Personalisation Review;
  - Men's Health Review;
  - A-Boards Review.
18. The following reviews were directly linked to the 'Build Strong Communities' element of the Council Plan 2011-15:

- Night-Time Economy Review
19. The following reviews were directly linked to the 'Create Jobs & Grow the Economy' element of the Council Plan 2011-15:
- Night-Time Economy Review;
  - External Funding Review;
  - Construction Skills Review;
  - Online Business / E-Commerce Review.
20. The Domestic Waste Recycling Review supported the 'Protect the Environment' element of the Council Plan 2011-15.
21. Finally, whilst the CEIAG review did not directly support the priorities within the Council Plan 2011-15, it did support a recommendation within the Children & Young People's Plan made by young researchers that asked for careers information and advice to be age appropriate, and for increased links between businesses and education.

### **Finance & Performance Monitoring**

22. Throughout 2013-14 the Overview & Scrutiny Committees received regular quarterly monitoring reports relating to the council's performance and finance management, in service areas specific to their individual remits.
23. In addition, they also received other monitoring reports specific to their individual terms of reference, as detailed below:
24. Corporate & Scrutiny Management Committee received presentations / updates on:
- The Workforce Strategy 2012-15;
  - The Annual Scrutiny Support Budget;
  - The Procurement Strategy;
  - Evaluation of the Service to City Programme;
  - The Council's Journey to Excellence in Equalities;
  - The Workplace Wellbeing Survey 2013.
  - The Annual Overview & Scrutiny Report for 2012-13;
25. The Community Safety Overview & Scrutiny Committee received updates on:
- Domestic Violence;



- The work of AVANTE (Alcohol & Violence in the Night-Time Economy);
  - Tethered Horses Policy;
  - Winter Maintenance Procedures.
  - Bi-annual performance reports from Safer York Partnership (SYP),
26. Community Safety Overview & Scrutiny Committee also met with the Police & Crime Commissioner and representatives from Safer York Partnership, the Probation Service, the Police and Crime Panel and the York and North Yorkshire Fire & Rescue Service in relation to their role of scrutineers of crime & disorder issues.
27. The Economic & City Development Overview & Scrutiny Committee received briefings/updates on:
- Major developments within the city;
  - Major transport initiatives and issues arising from them;
  - Local Enterprise Partnerships (LEPs);
  - Tour de France Grand Depart;
  - Green Travel Plans;
  - Newgate Market;
  - Lendal Bridge trial.
  - Council for Voluntary Services
  - Volunteering Opportunities for Under 16s
  - York Charter for Volunteering
28. The Health Overview & Scrutiny Committee has a statutory role to review and scrutinise the impact of services and policies of key partners on the health of the city's population. As such it received updates on:
- The implementation of the NHS 111 service;
  - Children's Cardiac Services;
  - Safeguarding Arrangements;
  - The Public Health Service Plan;
  - Section 136 of the Mental Health Act – Provision of a Place of Safety;
  - Friends and Family Test – Maternity Services;
  - Winter Pressures Money;
  - Carers' Strategy;
  - Residential, Nursing and Home Care Services;
  - The merger of Priory Medical Group Surgery and Abbey Medical Group;
  - Partnership Working in mental health services;
  - The way older people's mental health services are provided.

29. The Committee were also consulted on a number of issues:

- Changes to psychological therapies services in York, including St Andrew's Counselling and Psychotherapy Service;
- Practice merger between York Medical Group and Minister Health;
- Clinical Commissioning Group plans for re-commissioning of Community Services and Out of Hours GP Services

30. They also met with representatives of York Hospitals NHS Foundation Trust; Vale of York Clinical Commissioning Group; Leeds and York Partnership NHS Foundation Trust; Yorkshire Ambulance Service; Adult Social Care and NHS England for joint discussions on how they work together, and received reports from the Chief Executive of York Teaching Hospital NHS Foundation Trust on the Francis Report and Liverpool Care Pathway.

31. Finally, they received a number of reports and presentations i.e.:

- A presentation from the Care Quality Commission on changes to the way they inspect and regulate care services;
- A presentation on loneliness by the Joseph Rowntree Foundation / Joseph Rowntree Housing Trust Neighbourhood Approaches to Loneliness Team;
- Leeds and York Partnership NHS Foundation Trust Annual Report;
- York Teaching Hospital NHS Foundation Trust Annual Report;
- Yorkshire Ambulance Service Annual Report;
- Health & Wellbeing Board Annual Report

32. The Learning & Culture Overview & Scrutiny Committee received:

- York Museums Trust Bi-annual Partnership Delivery Plan Reports;
- York Theatre Royal Bi-annual Service Level Agreement Performance reports;
- Bi-annual Progress Reports on Safeguarding and Looked After Children;
- A school improvement and Ofsted update report;
- A report on safely reducing York's looked after children population;

33. In addition the Committee received presentations from the Chair of York @ Large on the ongoing work of York @ Large and how it works with the Council and other partners to deliver joint services, and the Chair of

Learning City York Partnership about “Unlocking York Talent”, the city’s first All Age Skills Strategy.

### **Acting as Critical Friend**

36. During the municipal year 2013-14 each of the Overview & Scrutiny Committees met with the relevant Cabinet Members to hear about their challenges and priorities for the year. They also met with some of the council’s appropriate statutory partners to hear about their priorities and challenges.

### **Monitoring Previous Recommendations**

37. Finally, each of the committees received bi-annual updates on the implementation of the approved recommendations arising from their previously completed scrutiny reviews. Those deemed to be fully completed were signed off.

### **Calling - In**

38. Throughout the municipal year 2013-14 there were six Cabinet/ Cabinet Member decisions called-in for consideration by CSMC. All the decisions were upheld. The items called-in were:
- West Yorkshire Plus York Transport Fund;
  - Alternative services to those currently provided by Toy Bus;
  - The Co-operative Council – a community benefit for libraries and archives;
  - 20mph in the west of York – speed limit order and consultation response;
  - Working closer with Leeds Bradford International Airport;
  - Winter maintenance review for the 2013/14 season;
  - Local Plan Consultation – Further Sites;
  - City Centre Competitiveness

### **Implications**

39. There are no known legal, HR and financial implications associated with the recommendation within this report.

### **Risk Management**

40. There are no known risks associated with the recommendation in this report.

**Recommendation**

41. Having considered the information within this report, Members are asked to approve this Annual Scrutiny Report which covers the period between June 2013 and May 2014, so that it may be presented to full Council in July 2014.

Reason: To enable its presentation to Full Council, in line with Constitutional requirements.

**Contact Details**

**Author:**

Steve Entwistle  
Scrutiny Officer  
Tel: 01904 554279

**Chief Officer Responsible for the report:**

Andrew Docherty  
Assistant Director Governance & ICT

Melanie Carr  
Scrutiny Officer  
Tel: 01904 552054

**Report Approved**

**Date:** 23 April 2014

**Specialist Implications Officer(s)** - None

**Wards Affected:**

**All**



For further information please contact the authors of the report

**Background Papers:** None

**Annexes:** None



---

**Corporate & Scrutiny Management Committee****12 May 2014**

Report of the Assistant Director for Finance, Property &amp; Procurement

**Procurement and Commissioning Scrutiny****Summary**

1. This report provides an update on the work being undertaken to engage local businesses in procurement activity for the Council.

**Background**

2. At the beginning of the municipal year 2013/14, the Scrutiny Management Committee identified Procurement as a possible scrutiny topic. In January 2014, the Committee received an overview of the strategic approach being taken by the City of York Council to procurement and commissioning, and progress in its delivery, and the Committee asked for a further report on the Council's strategy for engaging local businesses in procurement.

**Procurement & Commissioning Strategy**

3. The Procurement and Commissioning Strategy sets out our commitment to use our own procurement spend to support the local economy. It commits us to a tailored approach so that we achieve the optimum mix of social economic and environmental benefits. Local economic development is being achieved through a range of engagement mechanisms with local companies but also through the tailoring of the approach used for each tender. If we believe that the tender could result in local jobs or there is a potentially strong and competitive local market, the assessment criteria will be shaped to give weighting to the use of local labour/creation of local jobs. Local SMEs are targeted in invitations to tender (below EU limits) or made aware of the EU tender for larger pieces of work.

4. This process is subject to legal limitations as under EU procurement legislation it is illegal to restrict competition to member countries. It is however legal to establish evaluation criteria that award points for social economic and environmental outcomes and hence tenders can reflect the importance of local economic development without excluding or prejudicing bidders from outside the local area.
5. In 2012/13 the Council spent in the region of £120m on goods and services. In 2012/13 over 50% of this was with companies with billing addresses within the functioning economic geography (not specifically within the CYC boundaries). This is an extremely healthy position. This includes national companies who are locally based so does not strictly represent businesses based in the area but does represent a direct link between money going to companies who are creating local jobs and therefore the money being partly reinvested in the local economy. The same assessment is now being undertaken using the end of year spend data for 2013/14.
6. Good progress has been made in establishing the category management approach and the team are putting together the toolkits for use across the organisation to improve the effectiveness of our procurement activity. The Category Managers are also establishing positive working relationships with the relevant stakeholders for their area to develop category management plans that will ensure that processes and standards are consistent across the organisation. The Commercial Procurement team are only involved in approx 18% of the Council's total spend so there is still work to be done to ensure we are embedding standards across all areas of council expenditure
7. Approaches taken to encouraging local economy are set out below.
  - Developing the local supply chain through Bidders Days where local suppliers can come in and meet Council officers to discuss upcoming contracts. This is being organised with The Federation of Small Businesses and will include training on how to complete some of the necessary paperwork as well as getting feedback on how we can improve
  - Direct one to one engagement with suppliers – offer the opportunity to talk through future upcoming tenders and have a two way conversation about our requirements and the processes for tendering
  - PQQ/ITT Workshops for SMEs explain our procurement processes, explain why we use them and provide guidance on how to tender effectively with the public sector this should equip SMEs who have

less experience of the sector to compete effectively for CYC work and other tenders from public bodies.

- Outline the requirements of procurement exercise early, give bidders more time and more clarity on what we are wanting to procure, gives them the opportunity to ask questions in an informal way
- Development of a series of Toolkits for services to use- these will set out when and how we need to build local economic outcomes into tenders.
- Rotation System – for some categories of work we have a large number of potential suppliers and we deliberately rotate them so that the economic gain is shared and we develop a wider and more sustainable local market. This is actively managed using performance criteria to ensure that high performing suppliers are rewarded.
- Levelling the playing field for smaller companies and enabling them to compete fairly- These include removing some of the barriers to their involvement such as the need to produce 5 years of accounts. We can also simplify the process for some contracts, making it easier to do business with the Council.
- Implementation of the Living Wage through our supply chain when this involves staff who provide a service for or on behalf of the council on the council's premises or land involving two or more hours of work in any given day in a week, for eight or more consecutive weeks in a year on. This indirectly means that is more money circulating in the local economy.

## **Examples**

8. The following are examples of recent activity that have supported the local economy.
  - Beckfield Lane Site – contract awarded to Gentoo who are using all local suppliers and subcontractors and are supporting the establishment of
  - The remodelling / refurbishment of Flaxman Avenue where the criteria are weighted for support of local employment and apprentices.
  - External painting and repair contractors have made a commitment to use local suppliers and labour.
  - Schools building programme - Uses the YorBuild framework which establishes apprenticeships who move around contractors to develop their skill base

- Provision of Transport Services – evaluation of how bidders will support the local economy (i.e. encourage bidders to use local providers in their supply chain)

## **Risk Management**

9. There are risks identified with managing the local supply market through the procurement process, in particular the risk of legal challenge from national suppliers who may have a local depot or regional depot. These risks are mitigated by following the correct procedure and ensuring all bids are evaluated in a fair and transparent way.

## **10. Implications**

- **Financial** – Effective procurement is a prerequisite to delivering the Councils Financial Strategy. There are no financial consequences arising from this report.
- **Human Resources (HR)** - There are no HR implications arising from this report
- **Equalities** – The issue of how equalities issues are addressed through procurement were set out in the January report. There are no specific Equalities implications arising from this report
- **Legal** - All legal implications from individual procurements are dealt with on a project by project basis and there is close working between the Commercial Legal team and the Commercial Procurement Hub. There are particular legal implications regarding the implementation of ethical procurement - these are covered in the report.
- **Information Technology (IT)** – None
- **Property** - None
- **Risk Management**- failure to manage procurement activity effectively could give rise to the risk of legal challenge from poor procurement practices under EU law. Poor procurement practices are also likely to be highly inefficient and could waste money.

## **Recommendations**

11. Members are asked to consider the content of this report and identify any potential improvements to our approach to supporting the local economy through our procurement activity.



Reason: To ensure that there is effective scrutiny of the development of the commercial procurement and commissioning activity within the Council

**Contact Details**

Author:  
Tracey Carter  
AD Finance Property &  
Procurement  
CBSS Tel. 553419

Chief Officer Responsible for Report:  
Ian Floyd  
Director CBSS

Debbie Mitchell  
Head of Corporate Finance  
and Commercial  
Procurement  
CBSS

Report Approved  Date 30April 2014

Wards Affected: List wards or tick box to indicate all All

For further information please contact the author of the report

Background Papers – None

Annexes - None

Glossary of Abbreviations:

PQQ/ITT - Pre-qualification Questionnaire/ Invitations to Tender  
SME's - Small and Medium size Enterprises  
EU – European Union

This page is intentionally left blank

Meeting Date	Corporate & Scrutiny Management Committee Work Plan for 2013-14
15 July 2013 @ 5pm	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Attendance of new Cabinet Member for Finance, Performance &amp; Customer Services – Discussion around Priorities &amp; Challenges</li> <li>2. Bi-annual Workforce Strategy 2012-15 Monitoring Report(PS)</li> <li>3. Briefing on Potential Themed Topic – Night Time Economy</li> <li>4. Workplan 2013/14</li> </ol>
9 September 2013 @ 5pm	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. First Qtr Finance &amp; Performance Monitoring Report (DM)</li> <li>2. Evaluation of the Service to City Programme (PS)</li> <li>3. Further detailed briefing on Council’s Journey to Excellence in Equalities (CC) (Possible Attendee from another Local Authority, demonstrating good progress towards ‘Excellence’)</li> <li>4. Procurement Strategy Update (<i>deferred from May 2013</i>) (TC)</li> <li>5. Draft Annual Overview &amp; Scrutiny Report for 2012/13</li> <li>6. Workplan 2013/14 (inc. verbal update on ongoing scrutiny reviews)</li> </ol>
11 November 2013 @ 5pm	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Report &amp; Presentation on Workplace Wellbeing Survey 2013 Results</li> <li>2. Update on implementation of recommendations arising from Managing Staff Sickness Absence Review and Community Engagement Review</li> <li>3. Scoping Report for proposed scrutiny review on Equalities</li> <li>4. Workplan 2013-14</li> </ol>
13 January 2014@ 5pm	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Bi-annual Workforce Strategy 2012-15 Monitoring Report (PS)</li> <li>2. Second Qtr Finance &amp; Performance Monitoring Report</li> <li>3. Scrutiny Support Budget Monitoring Report (DS)</li> <li>4. Procurement Strategy Update</li> <li>5. Draft Final Report for Loans &amp; Grants Scrutiny Review</li> <li>6. Workplan 2013/14 inc. verbal update on Equalities Review</li> </ol>
10 March 2014 @ 5pm	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Third Qtr Finance &amp; Performance Monitoring Report</li> <li>2. Presentation of 3 final reports from Night-Time Economy Scrutiny Reviews &amp; ASB Update</li> <li>3. Workplan 2013/14 inc. verbal updates on any ongoing reviews</li> </ol>
7 April 2014 @ 5pm	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Wellbeing Staff Survey Update</li> <li>2. Presentation of 4<sup>th</sup> final report from Night-Time Economy Scrutiny Review (Learning &amp; Culture)</li> <li>2. NTE Review - Report on Supporting Work by OCE</li> <li>3. Attendance of Cabinet Member for Finance, Performance &amp; Customer Services– End of Year Update</li> <li>4. Draft Workplan for 2014/15 &amp; Discussion re Possible Scrutiny Topics for coming Municipal Year &amp; Possible Scrutiny Work Planning Annual Event</li> <li>5. Workplan 2012/13 inc. Verbal update on Equalities Review</li> </ol>
17 Apr @ 5pm	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Night–Time Economy Scrutiny Review - Draft Final Report (to be presented to Cabinet in May 2014)</li> </ol>

<b>12 May 2014 @ 5pm</b>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li><b>1. Update on implementation of recommendations arising from Managing Staff Sickness Absence Review and Community Engagement Review</b></li> <li><b>2. Draft Annual Scrutiny Report 2013-14</b></li> <li><b>3. Procurement Update on work being undertaken to engage local businesses in procurement activity for the Council</b></li> <li><b>4. Workplan 2013/14 &amp; Verbal Update on ongoing Equalities Scrutiny Review</b></li> </ol>
------------------------------	---

Scrutiny Work Planning Event Wednesday 14 May @5:30pm - Possible Scrutiny Topics for CSMC for 2014/15

1. In January 2014, having received an update on the Council's Procurement Strategy, the following was suggested as a possible area for review – *'The procurement activities of health and voluntary services and their relationships in an effort to assist with their preventative works'*.
2. Outstanding recommendation (xii) from previous Staff Sickness Absences Scrutiny Review – CSMC to re-visit the question of how best to create a change in culture once the revised policy and change to working practices had been embedded throughout the organisation.